More Than a Judge

The oath of judicial office – a solemn pledge to faithfully uphold the constitution and laws of our nation and the State of Ohio is but an opaque window into the world of responsibilities you have assumed. Did your legal education and years of experience in the practice of law, or even time as a magistrate, provide you with the basic knowledge required to competently decide all the matters on your court's docket? Perhaps, but probably not as much as you expected.

Guiding citizens through the resolution of the crisis that brought them to your court no longer necessarily ends with a fine, prison sentence, termination of a family relationship, probate of persons incapable of caring for themselves, and so many other matters requiring the attention of judges. Leading individuals onto a path for recovery, reentry, housing, employment, appropriate health and mental health service has become an integral and rewarding part of your judicial life. Skills rarely taught in law schools nor learned in the typical practice of law.

Just as the statutes and case law you apply are ever evolving, so are your opportunities to help individuals rebuild their lives. Take advantage of the training available for you and your staff to assist in this effort. Please find the time to read the two articles that follow – Chief Justice Kennedy outlines the assistance courts can provide veterans dealing with personal challenges and also invites you to join this Thursday's Lean Forward Initiative Veterans Summit either in person or on line – Retired Judge Patrick Carroll has authored the suggested procedure for expunging a previously sealed conviction record.

Every judge engages in rescue efforts daily, sometimes formally with specialized dockets, but even more often with guidance and appropriate referrals and staff assistance. You will be remembered more for the people you have helped along the way than by all the matters you have decided during your judicial service.

Paul 419-563-4966

paul.pfeifer@sc.ohio.gov

Suggested procedure for expunging a previously sealed conviction record.

Patrick Carroll, retired judge Revised, September 7, 2023

Introduction

Senate Bill 288 of the 134th General Assembly gives individuals with criminal convictions the ability to apply to the sentencing court to have the records of those convictions either sealed or expunged. It was the sponsor's intent that the person submit one application to the court, leaving the judge to determine which remedy, sealing or expunging, is appropriate. However, because the waiting period for eligibility is different for sealing a record than for expunging a record, it is entirely possible that someone will want to return to court to expunge a record that has previously been sealed. This document attempts to provide some guidance for courts in how to approach those situations.

Terminology

Prior to April 4, 2023, most criminal records were sealable, with only a few eligible for expungement (namely, criminal records of human trafficking victims and criminal charges of under a gun possession law that was later revoked). If a petition for sealing was granted, a criminal record was removed from public view and, except for some circumstances laid out in statute, unavailable and treated as if the underlying criminal conviction had not occurred. In contrast, to "expunge" is "to destroy, delete, and erase a record as appropriate for the record's physical or electronic form or characteristic so that the record is permanently irretrievable." R.C. 2953.31(B)(2)(b). In other words, shred.

"Sealing" was not separately defined in SB 288, but inferred from the usage in R.C. 2953.34(A), permitting inspection of sealed records, to have the record of conviction removed from the public record, but still maintained so that it may be accessed by statutorily enumerated persons or agencies.

Expunging or physically destroying a record of conviction is a remedy that was unavailable for most offenses prior to April 4, 2023.¹ A defendant is eligible to apply to either seal or expunge a misdemeanor conviction record six (6) months from final discharge for a minor misdemeanor and one (1) year for all other misdemeanors.² The same time limits apply to both remedies. Final discharge is not statutorily defined, but generally includes expiration of any period of community control supervision and payment of all fines and restitution.

Expunging a previously sealed conviction record.

Currently, a defendant may apply to have the conviction record either sealed or expunged. Prior to April 4, 2023, the record of conviction, if granted, would be sealed, regardless of the terminology used. An issue arises, however, of disclosure of a previously sealed record of conviction.

Upon receipt of an order to seal the conviction record, the court shall order all official records of the case that pertain to the conviction sealed and all index references to the case that pertain to the conviction deleted. R.C. 2953.32(C). The court may maintain a manual or computerized index of the sealed records which shall contain only the name of the persons who are the subject of the sealed records, alphanumeric identifiers that relate to that person, the word "sealed," the name of the person, agency, office, or department that has custody of the sealed records, and shall not contain the name of the crime committed. R.C. 2953.34(C). The effect of an order to seal is that the criminal proceedings shall be considered not to have occurred. R.C. 2953.32(D)(2)(b). See also, R.C. 2953.34(K)(1), R.C. 2953.34(L)(1), and R.C. 2953.521(F)(2).

Sealed criminal records are confidential. R.C. 2953.34 sets out who may inspect sealed criminal records. A court employee, other than the clerk or custodian of the index and records, may only inspect a sealed criminal record for the purpose of assessing points against a person under R.C. 4510.36 or for taking action with regard to points assessed. R.C. 2953.34(A)(13). There are numerous statutory provisions that unlawful disclosure of this information is a fourth degree misdemeanor. The person liable for disclosure varies based on the employment status of the person and the purpose of disclosure. R.C. 2953.34(I)(2)(b)(3), (J)(1), (J)(3), (K)(2), (L)(2), and R.C. 2953.60(B).

An issue occurs when a person with a previously sealed record calls the court to expunge the record, a remedy now available thanks to S.B. 288. The court or clerk employee should not disclose to an unknown caller the existence of a sealed criminal record. R.C. 2953.34(A)(3) permits inspection of records included in a sealing order upon application by the person who is the subject of the records, by the persons named in the application. Thus, while a person who has sealed his/her own records has a right to inspection, verification of identity is critical.

A recommended procedure would be to simply inform any caller to file a motion with the court explaining what the caller is requesting from the court. The motion may be filed under seal to prevent inadvertent disclosure and be accompanied by a driver's license or any other form of identification as determined by the court. This procedure protects court staff from any charge of unauthorized disclosure of a criminal record. The journal entry expunging the record should note that the record had been previously sealed. For immigration purposes if the applicant is not an American citizen, the journal entry should also set out the original charge and any amendment.

Hearing requirement on motion to expunge previously sealed conviction record.

R.C. 2953.32(C) requires the court to conduct a hearing on an application to expunge a record of conviction. The hearing requirement is mandatory. *State v. Haas*, 6th. Dist. Lucas, No. L-04-1315, 2005-Ohio-4350. See also, *State v. B. J.*, 8th. Dist. Cuyahoga, No. 105764, 2018-

¹ Although an applicant may seek to seal or expunge a record of conviction, a dismissal is limited to sealing only. R.C. 2953.33. R.C. 2953.33 was amended, effective October 3, 2023, to expunge a dismissal, acquittal, or no bill for any case or charge that the applicant would be able to seal.

² The time for either sealing or expunging a misdemeanor offense after final discharge is the same. A felony conviction has a different and longer period of time after final discharge to expunge the record of conviction. (For example, fourth or fifth degree felony convictions are eligible to be sealed one year after final discharge and expunged eleven years after final discharge.)

Ohio-177. The standard for granting an application to expunge the record is the same standard for sealing the record. R.C. 2953.32(D). Arguably, if the court previously granted the motion to seal, the court has determined valid grounds to expunge the record and an additional hearing is unnecessary.

Putting aside the mandatory requirement for a hearing, there is the issue of the applicant's change in circumstances from the time of the original order to seal the conviction record. For example, R.C. 2953.32(D)(1)(b) requires the court to determine whether criminal proceedings are pending against the applicant. New, unrelated criminal charges may have been brought against the applicant in the period since the prior order to seal the record. In addition, the prosecutor has the right to file any written objections thirty days prior to the hearing. Also, if the offense involved a victim, then the victim, victim's representative, or the victim's attorney has a right to notice of the hearing as well as the right to be heard at the hearing. R.C. 2930.171(A) and R.C. 2953.32(C) & (D)(1)(e).

The recommended procedure would be to set the case for a hearing with notice to the prosecutor and, if applicable, the victim. A victim has an ongoing responsibility to provide current contact information with the court's probation department. R.C. 2930.161. If the victim cannot be located, it should be noted on the record. If the victim cannot be located or there is no victim in the underlying offense and the prosecutor waives any objection, based on the updated probation report and incorporation of the evidence presented at the prior hearing to seal the record, the court may dispense with a second hearing to grant the application to expunge the record.

Additional fee for application to expunge conviction record after sealing.

R.C. 2953.32(D)(3) provides that a court shall charge of fifty dollars (\$50.00) as an application fee for a motion to expunge a conviction record. The statute does not exempt the fee because of a prior fee paid for a motion to seal the record. Based on the work involved to process the motion and subsequent order, as well as a hearing on the motion, it would appear that the fifty dollar fee is permitted for a motion to expunge even though the applicant paid a prior filing fee for a motion to seal the conviction record.

This application fee is allocated between or among the municipal, county and/or state government based on the underlying offense(s) convicted set out in the application. Effective October 3, 2023, R.C. 2953(D)(3) permits the court to charge an additional fee up to fifty dollars (\$50.00) for the expense of processing the motion and subsequent order. (135 H.B. 33). Both fees are subject to waiver if the applicant presents proof of indigency. If a poverty affidavit showing the applicant is indigent is filed with the clerk along with the application to expunge, a recommended procedure is to accept the application without the fee with the court reserving the right to charge a fee at a later date if at the hearing or while the application is pending the court determines that the applicant is not indigent.

9th Annual Veterans Summit

By Chief Justice Sharon L. Kennedy

As we prepare to honor our veterans this November 11, I am reminded of the opportunities we have to serve those who have served us and to raise awareness of the unique challenges veterans face because of their call to duty. Consider instituting a rule of practice in your court requiring probation staff to use the Veterans Reentry Search Service to make the invisible visible, advertise that legal aid societies across Ohio provide civil litigation and benefit restoration services to indigent veterans, and have you and your court staff attend the free 9th Annual Lean Forward Initiative Veterans Summit, "Intercept 0/1: Reaching Veterans Before They Enter the Criminal Justice System" on November 16.

There are many reasons why a veteran does not self-identify when he or she is a defendant in the criminal justice system. In recent years, however, the federal government has increased efforts to find justice-involved veterans in state court systems to provide those veterans treatment to combat the invisible wounds of war. Take the uncertainty out of the equation—use the <u>Veterans Reentry Search</u> <u>Service</u> at the Veterans Administration portal. Use of the portal is free, and an identified veteran can receive more than just treatment services. There are housing, education, and employment services too, and a partner to help you and the veteran navigate those services—a Veterans Justice Outreach specialist.

Did you know legal aid serves veterans in all 88 counties in Ohio? Half of legal aid societies in Ohio employ attorneys to exclusively handle the civil legal challenges veterans face, and several have specific federal grants to serve homeless veterans. If you know of a veteran facing civil legal challenges, have the veteran contact his or her local legal aid society at 1-866-LAW-OHIO or visit Ohio Legal Help. More information about legal services for Ohio's veterans is available.

Ohio Judicial Conference For the Record | Third Quarter 2023 4 Ohio Judicial Conference For the Record | Third Quarter 2023

Lastly, join us at the 9th Annual Lean Forward Initiative Veterans Summit on November 16th at the Vila Milano in Columbus or online. The summit is accredited for CLE and CEU and is free of charge. The theme of this year's summit is "Intercept 0/1: Reaching Veterans Before They Enter the Criminal Justice System." This program is not just for judges with veterans treatment dockets—it is for any judge or justice partner who deals with veterans struggling to come wholly home from service to our country. And because Ohio has the fifth-largest veterans population in the country, that means all Ohio judges.

While you and your staff will learn more at the Lean Forward Summit, the idea behind Intercept Zero is to connect veterans who have mental health and substance use disorders with services before they have contact with the criminal justice system. Intercept One involves the response law enforcement and emergency services have with veterans with mental health and substance abuse disorders. As leaders in your community, the summit will raise your awareness of the role all judges and justice partners play in helping our veterans return wholly home. Register online.

Finally, thank you to all the judges across Ohio there who served in our armed services. Happy Veterans Day! May God bless you all!

Judicial College Offerings

The Judicial College CLE schedule is available online. To view the calendar and sign up for courses, please visit this site

VISIT THE OHIO JUDICIAL CONFERENCE WEBSITE!

WWW·OHIOJUDGES·COM

CONTACT JUSTIN LONG AT THE OHIO JUDICIAL CONFERENCE FOR LOGIN ASSISTANCE

justin.long@sc.ohio.gov





Ohio Judicial Conference Staff

Executive Director

Hon. Paul Pfeifer, Retired 614-387-9762 <u>Paul.Pfeifer@sc.ohio.gov</u>

Legislative Counsel

Marta Mudri, Esq. 614-387-9764 <u>Marta.Mudri@sc.ohio.gov</u>

Deputy Legislative Counsel

Joshua Williams, Esq. 614-387-9767 Joshua.Williams@sc.ohio.gov

Deputy Legislative Counsel

Shawn Welch, Esq. 614-387-9765 Shawn.Welch@sc.ohio.gov

Fiscal/HR Officer

Aleta Burns 614-387-9757 Aleta.Burns@sc.ohio.gov

Legislative Services Specialist

Justin Long 614-387-9756 Justin.Long@sc.ohio.gov

Judicial Services Program Manager

Trina Bennington 614-387-9761 Trina.Bennington@sc.ohio.gov

Judicial Services Program Manager

Jennifer Whetstone 614-387-9766 Jennifer.Whetstone@sc.ohio.gov

Ohio Judicial Conference For the Record | Third Quarter 2023 8 Ohio Judicial Conference For the Record | Third Quarter 2023